



# City of Appleton

100 North Appleton Street  
Appleton, WI 54911-4799  
www.appleton.org

## Meeting Agenda - Final Utilities Committee

---

Wednesday, December 18, 2024

5:45 PM

Council Chambers, 6th Floor

---

### Special Meeting

1. Call meeting to order
2. Pledge of Allegiance
3. Roll call of membership
4. Approval of minutes from previous meeting

#### 5. Public Hearing/Appearances

#### 6. Action Items

[24-1580](#) Approval of an Engineering Services Contract for the North and Ridgeway Tower Coating Projects to Dixon Engineering, Inc. in the amount of \$129,390 plus a 7.5% contingency of \$9,704 for a total cost of \$139,094.

**Attachments:** [2025\\_North-Ridgeway Tower Coating Services Contract Award Memo.pdf](#)

**Legislative History**

12/10/24 Utilities Committee held

[24-1598](#) Approve Water Rate Study Consultant.

#### 7. Information Items

#### 8. Adjournment

*Notice is hereby given that a quorum of the Common Council may be present during this meeting, although no Council action will be taken.*

*Reasonable Accommodations for Persons with Disabilities will be made upon Request and if Feasible.*

*For questions on the agenda, contact Chris Stempa at 920-832-5945.*



DEPARTMENT OF  
**UTILITIES**

**Department of Utilities**  
Water Treatment Facility  
2281 Manitowoc Road.  
Menasha, WI 54952  
p:920-997-4200

[www.appleton.org/government/utilities](http://www.appleton.org/government/utilities)

## MEMORANDUM

**Date:** December 13, 2024  
**To:** Chairperson Vered Meltzer  
**CC:** Ryan Rice, Deputy Director of Utilities  
John Pogrant, Water Treatment Facility Operations Supervisor  
Kelli Rindt, Enterprise Accounting Fund Manager  
**From:** Chris Stempa, Director of Utilities  
**Subject:** **Utilities Committee Action: Approval of an Engineering Services contract for the North and Ridgeway Tower Coating Projects to Dixon Engineering, Inc. in the amount of \$129,390 plus a 7.5% contingency of \$9,704 for a total cost of \$139,094**

---

### BACKGROUND:

The Appleton Water Utility includes seven elevated storage structures (towers, standpipes, and reservoirs) within the City of Appleton distribution system. These structures are required by the Wisconsin Department of Natural Resources to be cleaned and inspected at least every five years. The interior and exterior paint coatings must be repaired or wholesale repainted as necessary to maintain structural integrity. Typically, the lifespan of a coating system is 15 years without requiring some level of maintenance. The inspections completed at the North Tower and Ridgeway Tower in 2020 revealed evidence of coating system failure. At that time, only spot repairs were made given the overall coating system condition. However, the recommendation was given to plan for a complete interior and/or exterior recoating project in 2025.

The Appleton Water Utility allocated a total of \$1.75 million dollars in the 2025 budget for the repainting of these tower sites (engineering services and coating contractor).

### PROPOSAL EVALUATION

Invitations for professional services proposals were sent to three qualified engineering firms, Dixon Engineering, Inc., McMahon Associates, Inc., and Strand Associates, Inc. These firms were selected for their project familiarity and project team members that have a history of similar water industry project work and a history with the Appleton Water Utility elevated storage sites.

An evaluation team completed their review of proposals and scored according to the results in the table below.

<b>COMPANY</b>	<b>QUOTE</b>	<b>SCORE</b>	<b>VALUE (\$/Pt)</b>
Dixon Engineering, Inc.	\$129,390	176	735
McMahon Associates, Inc.	\$99,600	95	1,048
Strand Associates	\$156,900	179	877

Note: The lowest price per point is considered the best value proposal

The proposal review team evaluation process occurs first and is independent of costs being disclosed. The sealed fees are opened after the team members scores are consolidated. The intent is to identify the best value proposal by analyzing the qualitative aspects of proposals in relation to price, without establishing price as a stand-alone, weighted criterion. This method simply divides each proposer's price by the qualitative score they earned to arrive at a "price per point." The lowest price per point is considered the best value proposal.

Of the submitted proposals, the evaluation team had scored Strand Associates the highest but only a three-point delta existed between them in the next firm, Dixon. Dixon's proposal was determined to provide the services required to deliver a successful project at the best overall best value based on the criteria previously outlined. Dixon has provided coating inspection services in the past at the Ridgeway and North Tower sites including within the Appleton Water Treatment Facility as part of the steel structure recoating work on the Accelerator Solid Contact Clarifier/Softeners.

## **RECOMMENDATION**

Approval of an Engineering Services contract for the North and Ridgeway Tower Coating Projects to Dixon Engineering, Inc. in the amount of \$129,390 plus a 7.5% contingency of \$9,704 for a total cost of \$139,094.

If you have any questions regarding this project, please contact Chris Stempa at ph: 832-5945.